

HALOCHOSCOPE

Congregation Shaaray Tefilah, Pittsburgh, PA

This week's question:

On Shabbos, may one remove a dry-cleaner's label, attached with a safety-pin, from clothing? May one wear the clothing with the label attached in a street where there is no Eruv?

The issues:

- (A) The Melachos of *Tofair*, sewing, *Kore'a*, tearing or unstitching, and *Koshair*, tying, and *Matir*, untying knots.
- (B) The Melacha of *Makeh Bepa'ush*, adding the finishing touches to a utensil.
- (C) *Hotza'ah*, carrying

(A) Tofair, Kore'a, Koshair, Matir

Tofair, sewing, is forbidden Scripturally on Shabbos. Only if the stitches are permanent, meaning that they will not unstitch by themselves, is it considered Tofair. Thus, a half stitch, where the thread goes into a garment one way but does not come back out, is not forbidden Scripturally. A full stitch, where the thread does come back through the cloth is forbidden only if the ends are then tied. In this case, many authorities say one could also be in violation of the Melacha of *Koshair*, tying. If the thread is sewn into the cloth three times, it is considered Tofair even without tying the ends. [See Shabbos 74b-75a, Ran and commentaries. Kalkeles Shabbos. Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 340:6 commentaries. Aruch Hashulchan 317:17-20.]

Kore'a, tearing, is also forbidden Scripturally, if it is not done for destructive purposes. Unstitching a seam is included in this prohibition, particularly when done in order to re sew it. If a knot is untied at the same time, the Melacha of *Matir*, untying a knot is also violated. Untying "professional" knots that are also permanent such as those made by a shoemaker in the course of his work is forbidden Scripturally. Some opinions forbid any permanent knots Scripturally, even those not usually tied by a professional, while others only forbid these Rabbinically. Temporary knots such as those made to be untied later that day, or in a way that they should be very easy to untie when necessary, may be both tied and untied. Nonetheless, if a knot is made by a professional as part of his work, even if it is loose enough to be untied easily, it has the status of a forbidden knot. [See Shabbos 111b-112b, etc. Sh. Ar. O.C. 317 commentaries.]

The question then arises: do these Melachos apply to pins and safety pins when they are used with cloth in the place of thread? May a person fasten a badge or brooch to his clothing? The Talmud permits using a pin to hold two sides of a garment together, such as a scarf or shawl. Although the Talmud is referring to the problem of carrying, it could not discuss it at all if it is forbidden because of Tofair. If the pin is inserted into the cloth once or even twice, even if it is like thread it is not Scriptural Tofair since the ends are not tied to keep it in place. However, it could still be forbidden Rabbiniically when inserted even less than three times. Furthermore, a safety-pin is indeed secured, which is equivalent to tying the ends, although not in a permanent knot. Consequently, using a safety-pin could be forbidden Scripturally because of Tofair if it is inserted more than once into the garment. For the same reason, removing the pin could be forbidden because of Kore'a. However, it seems that only when the two sides of the garment or cloth are sewn together to become one piece can the connection be considered Tofair. Thus hooks, buttons and the like may be used to join two sides of a garment. Similarly, when using a safety-pin to fasten a diaper, one is not connecting the cloth into one piece. Furthermore, although, to be sure, unstitching is Kore'a, the translation of the word is "tearing". This implies that the Melacha is usually done by ripping the cloth because it is the most convenient way to separate the parts. When a safety-pin is used, the separation is not usually done by ripping the connection apart. The whole reason for using the pin is to be able to separate it in the same way it was connected. In this sense it is more like the Melacha of Matir, "undoing", but is not forbidden because the knot is not permanent at all. [See Shabbos 60a, 75a, Korban Nesanel Shabbos 7:50. Sh. Ar. 303:9, 308:11, 340:6, commentaries (Mishne Berurah). Aruch Hashulchan 317:18-19. Shemiras Shabbos Kehilchasa 14:48,53 and notes. Igros Moshe O.C. Vol. 2 No 84.]

One could distinguish between diaper-pins, which are intentionally temporary, and dry-cleaner pins which are sometimes left on the clothing for longer periods. Nonetheless, the above reasons do seem to indicate that removal of these pins would not be forbidden because of Kore'a. Similarly, removing a manufacturer's label or price-tag that is not sewn on to the garment but attached by a pin or plastic thread which is not inserted twice is not considered Kore'a. If it is sewn on, even if the label is only paper, its removal constitutes Kore'a.

(B) Makeh Bepatish

The actual translation of the words "Makeh Bepatish" is "striking with a hammer". When one has finished shaping a metal pot, he hammers out the bumps and dents before actually using it. This, along with any other finishing touch that is done to a product is forbidden Scripturally. Accordingly, if the neck of a garment was sewn shut while the garment was made, one may not open the stitches on Shabbos which completes the production of the garment. Similarly, one may not remove tacking or other loose thread from a new garment

because this is usually done by the tailor as a finishing touch. Removing the tailor's pins would also be forbidden under this category. However, removing a price-tag would depend on the way it is attached. If it is difficult to remove, it could be considered the final act of finishing the garment and making it wearable, whereas a price-tag that was loosely attached by a pin or looped around a button was never really part of the garment. [See Shabbos 75b 48a-b. Sh. Ar. O.C. 302:2, 317:3, 340:14. commentaries. Aruch Hashulchan 302:6-8. Shmiras Shabbos Kehilchasa 14:49.]

However, in a case such as our own, where the garment was already finished and a label was attached later for temporary identification, its removal does not constitute Makeh Bepatish. In addition, if the label is in an inconspicuous place such as in the lining, and does not bother the wearer, its removal is not being done to finish the garment. Nonetheless, the remover of the label evidently does not want to leave it there, and removing it might therefore be forbidden for him. In addition, if the label is in a place where it bothers the wearer, such as the back of the neck, its removal is more necessary. However, in this case, it is even more obvious that the label was only placed there temporarily and would thus present no problem of Makeh Bepatish. [See Sh. Ar. O.C. 317:3. commentaries.]

(C) Hotza'ah

In a public domain where there is no Eruv, carrying is forbidden Scripturally. If the carrying is done in an unusual way it is not forbidden Scripturally, but Rabbiniically, known as *Kil'achar Yad*. Wearing clothing is not carrying, but wearing something that is not usually worn as clothing is considered Hotza'ah *Kil'achar Yad*. Sometimes, even though the item is being worn on part of the body, since this is the way it is usually transported it is considered Hotza'ah Scripturally. For example, a sword is always carried in its scabbard which is worn on the body. Some key chains are always attached to one's belt and are therefore Hotza'ah.

Sometimes something is *Batel*, insignificant, to the garment and is therefore not forbidden at all. The rule here is that the item is attached to the garment and is usually worn this way on the weekdays. In addition it should not be something that would be removed easily for any reason and should also be something that has no significance of its own to the wearer, for example, a spare shirt button but not a spare coat button. [See Shabbos 57a-58a, 67, etc. Sh. Ar. O.C. 201:7.]

Tailors usually have a needle attached to their clothing in an inconspicuous place; this is *Derech Hotza'ah*, the normal way of carrying, for them, and is therefore forbidden Scripturally. However, if one has pins or safety-pins attached to one's clothing where they are not usually transported this way, there is no Scriptural violation. Moreover, if the wearer is not really bothered by their presence and there is no risk that he will be tempted to remove them in the street and carry them in his hands, they are *Batel* to the garment and not even forbidden Rabbiniically. (A good way to gauge whether he is bothered by their presence is if he

would remove them even on a weekday.) Since the pins and label are not significant in their own right, they can become Batel. [See Shabbos 11a-b. 62a, etc. Sh. Ar. O.C. 301:8, 23,38. 303, etc. commentaries. See also Shemiras Shabbos Kehilchasa 16:31-40]

In conclusion: If the labels are in an inconspicuous place, it is probably preferable not to remove them, even if the garment will be worn in a street where there is no Eruv. If, however, they are conspicuous, or in a place where they bother the wearer, they should rather be removed than worn in the street.

© 1993 Rabbi Shimon Silver

ANNOUNCEMENTS

SCHEDULE:

SHABBOS SHACHARIS	9:00 am
SHABBOS MINCHA	4:35 pm
SHACHARIS SUNDAY	8:00 am
SHACHARIS MON - FRI	7:00 am
MINCHA SUN - THURS	4:45 pm
CANDLE-LIGHTING VAYESHEV	4:35 pm
MINCHA EREV SHABBOS	4:45 pm

SHIURIM:

GEMORO Makos-	
	SUNDAY 7:15 am
HALACHA B'Iyun-	
	MONDAY 8:30 pm
HILCHOS Shabbos	
	SHABBOS 8:15 am

-There will be a Junior Minyan for boys on the third floor beginning at 9:00. Kiddush and refreshments sponsored by Meir Pfeffer.

-There will be a playgroup with refreshments for preschoolers and first-grade girls on the second floor.

This issue of HALOCHOSCOPE has been sponsored by Dr. Abby Mendelson for a Refuah Sheleimah for Miriam bas Chana Rochel.

Anyone interested in subscribing to Halochoscope may send their name and address, along with a check for \$36 made out to Congregation Shaaray Tefilah, to the address below. Please note in the "memo" of the check that this is for a subscription to Halochoscope.

Comments and suggestions are welcome and can be addressed to :

Rabbi Shimon Silver
 Congregation Shaaray Tefilah
 5741 Bartlett Street
 Pittsburgh, PA 15217 (412) 521-5419/9911