

# HALOCHOSCOPE

Congregation Shaaray Teffillah, Pittsburgh, PA

This week's question:

If one is davening, and the Chazzan is already saying Kaddish, may he continue davening, or should he stop and listen to the Chazzan?

The issues to be discussed:

- (A) The Kaddish
- (B) The Amein response
- (C) *Shomei'a Ke'onah*, listening is like answering.
- (D) Interrupting one's davening, especially to respond to the Chazzan.
- (E) Doing or saying anything during Kaddish.

## (A) The Kaddish

In the Talmud, the Kaddish is usually referred to as the "Amein, Yehei Shemei Rabba" prayer. This is understood primarily as a prayer for the future glorification of Hashem's Name in the times of Moshiach when Hashem's are destroyed. It is one of the most lofty prayers of praise that we have. The Talmud teaches that the fervent recitation of Amein Yehei Shemei Rabba can annul a lifetime of evil decrees. It is therefore understood to be the most serious and sacred of the response part of the davening. When saying or listening to Kaddish, one should concentrate on Galus Hashechina, the exile of the Divine Presence from our midst. It is an extremely serious offense to talk while the Chazzan is saying Kaddish. It is only said with a Minyan present, as it is considered a Davar Shebikedusha [See Halochoscope Vol 1 No 28] and is recited only in the presence of a Minyan, after prayer or Torah-study.

The actual Kaddish is made up of three parts. The main part is Yehei Shemei Rabba until Da'amiran Bealma. According to some, the Tzibbur says the whole section out loud; others say that only until Almaya is said by the Tzibbur. The beginning, from Yisgadal until Yehei Shemei, is only said by the Chazzan with the Tzibbur listening and repending Amein at the appropriate times. This is a *Hazmana*, an "invitation", so to speak. Any Davar Shebikedusha must have a Hazmana before it, calling on the Tzibbur to respond. The Tzibbur should therefore listen to the Chazzan at this time and concentrate on the upcoming Davar Shebikedusha. After Da'amiran Be'alma Veimru Amein, we add various prayers of supplication. This is considered a Minhag and not part of the Kaddish prayer, and it is only said some of the time.

Within the main part of Kaddish, there are two opinions whether its second part is as holy as the first. It is our practice in Ashkenazic lands to say only until Yisbarach aloud but to listen intently to the rest while the Chazzan says it. However, if the Chazzan rushes ahead so that a respondent misses part of the rest while saying Yehei Shemei, it is proper for him to complete it himself.

There are certain junctures during davening when Kaddish is mandatory, and at other times only customary. Since it is clear that Kaddish is both an obligatory part of the Tefilla with a Minyan, and a most lofty form of Kavod Hashem, the members of a Minyan, as well as anyone else who happens to hear the Kaddish must respond. [See Berachos 3a, Tosafos. 21b. Shabbos 119b, Succah 39a etc. Teshuvos Harosh 4:19. Tur and Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 56, 125. Baer Hetev 56:1. commentaries. Poskim. Aruch Hashulchan O.C. 125:1-2. 55:3-4]

### (B) Amein

The response of Amein occurs in Tanach. The Talmud explains it as having three meanings: 1. *Ha'amanas Devarim*, believing and agreeing that what was said is true. 2. Acceptance of an oath. 3. Acceptance of a proposal. In addition it is also an expression of yearning, "if only it were so" In the Kaddish, the Amein expresses this meaning.

In any case, it is a response to what has been said immediately previously. We see that although the respondent did not actually repeat what he heard, it is considered as if he had, because the Amein has the power to "transfer" those words to the respondent. Based on this, it is possible to fulfill one's obligation of reciting a Brocha by answering Amein to someone else's Brocha. Although listening to the Brocha is also sufficient, answering Amein is even better because it is more like reciting the Brocha itself. [See Shavuos 36a. Succah 38b, Aruch Laner. Aruch Hashulchan O.C. 124:11. Shaarei Teshuva O.C. 215:4. Or Sameach Hil. Krias Shema 4:8.]

Most Poskim, based on a Passuk in Ha'azinu (32:3, Sifri), consider it obligatory to answer Amein to any Brocha one happens to hear. In this case one is obligated to answer Amein even if he did not hear the whole Brocha, but only the last part. The obligation of hearing Kaddish is different than any Brocha-one must attempt to hear Kaddish in order to answer Amein. Therefore, one must listen in silence to the first part of the Kaddish so as to know what his Amein is for. The whole Kaddish requires a Minyan of respondents, so if one is in Shul at the beginning of Kaddish, he should view himself as one of the only ten members of this Minyan (even if there are many more present) and listen in silence from the beginning of Kaddish. This is especially true here where the Amein is an expression of yearning that "may it be so" (May what be so?) Usually one may not answer Amein if one did not hear the Brocha at all; this is called *Amein Yesoma*, an "orphan Amein". However, this does not apply to Amain which is said on something which is not a personal obligation. *Chazoras Hashatz*, the Chazzan's repetition of the Shemone Esrei, Kedusha and Kaddish, although obligatory on the Tzibbur, are not personal obligations since they are not said by an individual without a Minyan. Therefore, as long as one knows which Brocha it is being said for, one may answer Amein in these cases even if he didn't hear the Chazzan. If, therefore, one is still davening Shemone Esrei while the Chazzan begins Kaddish or Kedusha and finishes while the Tzibbur is in the middle, he may answer with them. If he missed the beginning of Yehei Shemei, there is a question whether he may begin with Amein or only start with Yehei Shemei. It is therefore advisable to start with Yehei Shemei unless one is able to concentrate on the Amein and link it to what he knows the Chazzan said previously. [See Berachos 47a. Tosafos Succah 51b, 52a Tosafos. Tur and Sh. Ar. O.C. 124:9,11.

Magen Avraham 18, commentaries. O.C. 56:1. Magen Avraham 5. Mishneh Berurah 9. Aruch Hashulchan O.C. 109:9.]

### (C) Shomeia Keoneh

Most of the Mitzvos that require an utterance can be fulfilled by listening to someone else saying them provided that both the reciter and the listener have in mind to fulfill the Mitzvah this way. This is known as *Shomeia-the listener, Keoneh-* is like one who answers or says it. One can fulfill the Mitzvah this way even if one does not say Amain. In fact there are those who say that if one does indeed say Amain it is as if one has actually said the Brocha, whereas Shomeia Keoneh only counts as a fulfillment of the obligation, without the Brocha itself. [See Succah 38b Or Sameach Hil. Shema 4:8. Tur Sh. Ar. O.C. 213, commentaries and Poskim.]

### (D) Interrupting One's Davening

One may not interrupt one's davening unnecessarily, but certain interruptions are permitted. The different parts of the services have varying degrees of interruptability. For example, when saying the Shema, one should not greet anyone. There are exceptions to this [see Brachos 13a]. There is also a difference whether one is in the middle of a paragraph or between paragraphs.

When the Shliach Tzibbur reaches Kaddish or Kedusha, in most cases one may interrupt one's davening to answer their main parts. The reason for this is that if one may reply to a greeting of one who commands respect and awe, he may certainly respond to a praise of Hashem. However, during one's silent Shemone Esrei he may not answer even a king's greeting. What about Kaddish and Kedusha? The Talmud rules that one may not interrupt one's Shemone Esrei even for Yehei Shemei. There is a question whether one should stop and listen to the Chazzan thereby fulfilling the Mitzvah with Shomeia Keoneh. Some say that this is as if one has actually said it and is considered an interruption. However, we rule that it is not and one should indeed stop and listen to the Chazzan. There are opinions that one should listen only until Olmaya, but others say one should remain silent until Da'amiron Bealma. However, one need only do this for the main Kadeishim, not for the additional ones at the end of davening. [See Berachos 13a-b, etc. 21b. Tosafos. Succah 38b Rashi Tosafos etc. Sh. Ar. O.C. 66:3 Magen Avraham etc. 104: Magen Avraham 7 Machatzis Hashekel. 109, Magen Avraham 3. Aruch Hashulchan 6-7. 125, Magen Avraham 1.]

### (E) Doing or Saying Anything During Kaddish

It has already been stressed that during Kaddish one may not speak because one must concentrate on the words of the Chazzan so as to know what the Amein is for. For the same reason, one should not do anything, such as winding up his Tefilin. One should also not begin a Tefilla at this time. However, if one has already begun a part of davening, may he continue davening until the Chazzan reaches Amein Yehei Shemei, or must he stop and listen from Yisgadal? Furthermore, may one begin, knowing that he will not be able to finish before the Chazzan begins Kaddish?

If one is in the middle of Shemone Esrei, it is clear that he should not stop for more than is absolutely necessary, which means that he should only stop for Yehei Shemei, and according to some until Da'amiran Bealma. We find that

if one has not yet said Shemone Esrei and will be able to finish in time to say Yehei Shemei, he may begin even though he will not finish in time for the start of Kaddish. Likewise, if one has not yet put on Taliss and Tefillin, but will be able to finish putting them on before Yehei Shemei, he may do so even though he will miss the beginning of Kaddish. (He must finish before Yehei Shemei because there can be no interruption between the two Tefillin even for Kaddish.) Apparently, provided one began at a time when he was permitted to, he may continue through the Hazmana part of Kaddish. Therefore, one may begin, for example, Aleinu with the Tzibbur and continue saying it even after the Chazzan begins Kaddish. He should stop to answer Yehei Shemei and not resume his Aleinu until after Daamiran Bealma. [See Sh. Ar. O.C. 109 Magen Avraham. 2. Levushei Serad. Mishneh Berurah 54:12. 25:56.]

© 1993 Rabbi Shimon Silver

### ANNOUNCEMENTS

#### SCHEDULE:

SHABBOS SHACHARIS	9:00 AM
SHABBOS MINCHA	4:45 PM
SHACHARIS SUNDAY	8:00 AM
SHACHARIS MONDAY - FRIDAY	7:00 AM
MINCHA SUNDAY - THURSDAY	4:55 PM
CANDLE-LIGHTING TOLDOS	4:47 PM
MINCHA EREV SHABBOS TOLDOS	4:55 PM

#### SHIURIM:

GEMORO MAKOS	SUNDAY	7:15 AM
HALACHA B'YUN	MONDAY	8:30 PM
HILCHOS SHABBOS	SHABBOS	8:15 AM

Kiddush this week is being by Chaim Twerski who will be making a Siyum on Mishnayos Seder Kodshim.

#### **Special Announcement.-**

**There is a meeting of the general membership on Wednesday night, October 10th, at 8:00 pm. At this meeting officers and board- members will be elected, and there will also be further discussion on our plans for a new home.**

This issue of HALOCHOSCOPE has been sponsored by Mr. Merv Berkman in honor of the Yorzite of Rabbi Meir Kahana, Hashem Yinkom Damo, (may Hashem avenge his blood) on the 18th of Cheshvan.

Anyone interested in a subscription (\$36/Yr) or a sponsorship (\$50), please send it, along with your name and address, to the address below.

Comments and suggestions are welcome and can be addressed to :  
 Rabbi Shimon Silver  
 Congregation Shaaray Tefillah  
 5741 Bartlett Street  
 Pittsburgh, PA 15217 (412) 521-5419/9911