

HALOCHOSCOPE

Congregation Shaaray Tefillah, Pittsburgh, PA

The question:

When there are two days of YomTov before Shabbos, may one use food for Eruv Tavshilin that will not remain edible unless it is kept frozen?

The issues to discuss:

- (A) What is *Eruv Tavshilin*, and how does it work?
- (B) Which foods should be used?
- (C) The requirement of *Rauy La'achila*, fit to be eaten.

(A) *Eruv Tavshilin*

It is forbidden to cook or prepare food on YomTov for the following day. This is called *Hachana*. Likewise, one may not prepare on YomTov for Shabbos when YomTov falls on Erev Shabbos and certainly not prepare on Shabbos for a YomTov which falls on the following day.

The original prohibition of *Hachana* is Scriptural. However, not all cases are considered *Hachana* Scripturally by everyone. In the Talmud there is one opinion that the original *Hachana* only forbids preparing on YomTov for *Chol*, weekday after. When YomTov is followed by Shabbos, they can be viewed as a continuous *Kedusha Achara*, a single, "day of holiness" in this respect; another explanation is that since one must prepare for Shabbos in advance, it is considered *Tzorech Ochel Nefesh* of YomTov, the type of *Melacha* permissible for this day of YomTov. The other opinion is that *Hachana* is always forbidden Scripturally. [See Pesachim 46b 47a. Eruvin 38a Rashi, Tosafos, etc.]

To enable us to prepare for Shabbos when Erev Shabbos is a YomTov, the Rabbis instituted the *Eruv Tavshilin*. We set aside some food that is already prepared on Erev YomTov to be eaten on Shabbos, and we declare that we have begun cooking for Shabbos on Erev YomTov, and will continue doing so on YomTov.

A few questions arise: If *Hachana* from YomTov to Shabbos is forbidden Scripturally, how can a Rabbinical institution permit it? If it is not forbidden Scripturally, is it forbidden Rabbinically? If not, why is the *Eruv* necessary?

According to the opinion that *Hachana* is Scripturally forbidden even on YomTov-Erev Shabbos, normal preparations are not necessarily Scriptural *Hachana*. Firstly, there is always the possibility that this food will be needed for the same day, if, for example, unexpected guests come later in the day. In the Talmud, this is shortened to the term *Ho'il*. This idea is used by the Talmud in a number of instances to explain how, in retrospect, one cannot fault someone for violating certain prohibitions. This does not permit intentional *Hachana* but is

sufficient to allow Hachana for Shabbos when one has prepared an Eruv; i.e., Hachana is indeed forbidden, but not necessarily Scripturally, and therefore the Eruv can help. It should be noted that according to this, even if one has made an Eruv, one may only cook foods that will be ready to serve unexpected guests within reason while it is still Erev Shabbos.

Secondly, Scriptural Hachana is derived from the Mon in the wilderness. The Mon did not fall on Shabbos or YomTov, and any food made from it had to be prepared beforehand. From the terminology in the Torah it is implied that on Shabbos or YomTov, one may not prepare food, which would have been necessary had the Mon fallen on those days. However, only Mon or other food that was not available on Erev YomTov would be forbidden to prepare on YomTov. Food that is available on Erev YomTov, albeit in a raw state, is Scripturally considered *Muchan*, prepared, and merely cooking it is only Rabbinical Hachana for which an Eruv can help.

There are two viewpoints in the Talmud explaining how the Eruv permits Rabbinically-forbidden Hachana. One approach is that there is really no Rabbinical prohibition of Hachana per se on YomTov for Shabbos. However, in the joy of celebrating YomTov, one might forget to honor Shabbos adequately. To remind oneself to prepare enough food for Shabbos, one sets aside an Eruv on Erev YomTov while still preparing for YomTov, and declares that this is for Shabbos. Thus one is reminded to prepare just as well for Shabbos. The reason it is done on Erev YomTov rather than on YomTov itself (while preparing the YomTov meal in the morning) is because one might then forget about it altogether. As a consequence of this institution, rather than a cause for it, it was forbidden to prepare for Shabbos on YomTov without having made an Eruv on Erev YomTov. Hence, Hachana is Rabbinically forbidden defacto. Eruv helps by acting as a *Heker*, a reminder of *Kavod Shabbos*, the honor of Shabbos.

The other approach is that Hachana is indeed forbidden Rabbinically on YomTov-Erev Shabbos. Although Hachana on YomTov for Chol is forbidden Scripturally, people would be confused by the fact that (Scripturally) it is allowed for Shabbos, and might come to do Hachana for Chol. Therefore, Hachana was forbidden by the Rabbis unless an Eruv had been set aside on Erev YomTov. Thus, people will be led to draw the conclusion: if Hachana on YomTov for Shabbos is forbidden (unless one has begun the preparations on Erev YomTov, the Eruv), it must certainly be forbidden to prepare on YomTov for Chol. This way the Torah prohibition is reinforced. [See Beitza 2b. 15b. Pesachim 46b. Eruvin 38a. Rashi. Tosafos. commentaries. Rambam Hil YomTov 6:1-2. For an explanation of the use of the word "Eruv" see Rambam and Raavad there.]

(B) Foods Suitable for Eruv Tavshilin

Since we have explained that the purpose of the Eruv Tavshilin is to "begin" cooking for Shabbos, the food being used for the Eruv must be cooked. Food cooked by any method, counts for this, and is considered "beginning cooking" for any other foods or methods of cooking. The minimum amount is the size of a large olive, a *Kezayis*. Bread is not acceptable for the Eruv, since it is a common food and is not readily seen as being specially designated for Shabbos, there is no *Heker*. Specifically, one should use a food that is suitable as an accompanying dish with bread. However, there is an opinion that cooking does

not include baking and that all Talmudic references to an Eruv of cooked food refer to a cooking Eruv; therefore if one intends to bake, one must include bread in the Eruv. This view is not accepted as Halacha, but we follow it as a Minhag. However, if one only used a cooked food, he may rely on it to bake as well. [See Beitza 16a, 17b, Tosafos, Rosh, Ran, Rambam, Hil YomTov 6:3. Tur and Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 527:2]

Ideally, one should use a whole Challah or Matzah and a whole serving of fish or meat because of *Hidur Mitzvah*, beautifying the Mitzvah. It is appropriate to use the Eruv Challah as part of the *Lechem Mishneh*, the two loaves for all the meals on Shabbos and to eat it at the Seuda Shlishis, thus preforming many Mitzvos with it. [See Sh. Ar. O.C. 527. Taz 7. Magen Avraham 15. Baer Haitev 2.]

(C) Rauy La'achila

The food used for the Eruv must be fit to eat, both at the time the Eruv is made and on Erev Shabbos while the food for Shabbos is being prepared. Ideally, the Eruv should last into Shabbos. If, however, it was eaten before Shabbos, after all the food had been prepared, it was still valid. This requirement, *Rauy La'achila*, excludes a number of different foods for various reasons.

Firstly, there is a question if one may make an Eruv with more than one YomTov-Erev Shabbos in mind. For example, may one make an Eruv for Rosh Hashana with Succos in mind as well, or for the first days of Succos with the last days in mind. According to the opinion in section A that the purpose of the Eruv is to ensure that one gives the Shabbos as much honor as YomTov, one must prepare the Eruv as close to Shabbos as possible, i.e., no earlier than that Erev YomTov. According to the opinion that a *Heker* is needed to distinguish between the Hachana of YomTov for Shabbos and that done for Chol, an Eruv made earlier is a sufficient *Heker*. Nonetheless, doubts are raised about this view and the practice is to make a separate Eruv each time. However, if one did have a later YomTov in mind and forgot to make a new Eruv at the later date, he may rely on this view. One of the objections raised is that since the Eruv is supposed to represent some of the food that is being prepared for Shabbos, if it is kept for too long it will start to go bad. Even if it does not go bad, *Ibur Tzura*, a change in its appearance, is also objectionable. However, since it is still fit to be eaten, this does not invalidate the Eruv, but is not the ideal. [See Rosh Beitza 2:1. Beis Yosef citing Kolbo and Sh. Ar. O.C. 527:14 commentaries.]

If, however, the food becomes inedible by the time the preparations for Shabbos are made, it is invalid, and one may not rely on it to cook for Shabbos. Since the Eruv represents the start of Shabbos cooking, it cannot have been eaten or destroyed when the preparations are continued. This includes decayed food. If it can be predicted before YomTov that the food will be bad by Shabbos, it should not be used for the Eruv. For this reason, before refrigeration, the practice was to use a boiled egg for the Eruv rather than cooked fish or meat. [See Beitza 15b Sh. Ar. O.C. 527:15. Aruch Hashulchan 13.]

If the food being used for the Eruv requires something to complete its processing, it is not considered fit for the Eruv. For example, foods salted to preserve (which are sometimes considered Halachically "cooked") require being washed off from their salt before they can be eaten. In our case: the food being used was fish cooked on a Monday and, even with refrigeration, would probably

not last until Friday. May the fish be frozen or does thawing count as finishing its processing? Since it is fully cooked and will be readily edible on Shabbos without any further processing, it may be considered Rauy La'achila. [See Beis Yosef O.C. 527. Magen Avraham 3. Mishneh Berurah 15-17.]

© 1993 Rabbi Shimon Silver

ANNOUNCEMENTS

SCHEDULE:

SELICHOS EREV YOM KIPPUR	6:45 AM
MINCHA EREV YOM KIPPUR	3:00 PM
KOL NIDREI	7:00 PM
HAFAKA - CANDLELIGHTING	6:55 PM
SHACHARIS YOM KIPPUR	9:00 AM
MINCHA YOM KIPPUR	4:45 PM
END OF TAANIS	7:54 PM

SHACHARIS SUNDAY	8:00 AM
SHACHARIS MONDAY - WEDNESDAY	7:00 AM
MINCHA SUNDAY - TUESDAY	7:00 PM
— REMEMBER ERUV TAVSHILIN —	
CANDLE-LIGHTING EREV YOMTOV	6:48 PM
MINCHA EREV YOMTOV	6:55 PM

Mazel Tov to Rabbi & Mrs. Chanina Nadoff for the birth of their son. The Bris will take place on Erev Yom Kippur after Shacharis.

SHIURIM:

GEMORO MAKOS	SUNDAY 7:15 AM
HILCHOS SHABBOS	YOM KIPPUR 8:15 AM
DAF YOMI	SUNDAY 8:50 AM
	MON-TUES 8:15 PM

As in previous years, Rabbi Silver is collecting Tzedaka for YomTov supplies for needy families in Yerushalayim to be distributed by Rav Shlomo Kaplan of Aish Hatorah.

WISHING ALL A GEMAR CHASIMA TOVA !!

This issue of HALOCHOSCOPE has been sponsored by Mr. Jack Rubin in memory of his father, Harav Reuven Yona Rubin z"l.

Anyone interested in subscribing to Halochoscope may send their name and address, along with a check for \$36 made out to Congregation Shaaray Tefillah, to the address below. Please note in the "memo" of the check that this is for a subscription to Halochoscope.

Comments and suggestions are welcome and can be addressed to :
Rabbi Shimon Silver
Congregation Shaaray Tefillah
5741 Bartlett Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15217 (412) 521-5419/9911