

HALOCHOSCOPE

Congregation Shaaray Tefillah, Pittsburgh, PA

The qustion:

May someone take challahs out of the freezer on the first day of YomTov so that they will defrost in time for the YomTov Seudah of the second night?

The issues to discuss:

(A) What is *YomTov Sheini*, the second day of YomTov?

(B) *Hachanah* - preparing on Shabbos or YomTov for the next day.

(A) YomTov Sheini Shel Galus

In Eretz Yisroel only one day of YomTov is kept as the Torah only discusses one day. The Yomim Tovim are calculated according to the lunar calendar. Ideally, the *Sanhedrin*, the leading Rabbinical body, fixed each new lunar month according to the testimony of witnesses who had seen the new moon. In this way, Rosh Chodesh of any month could be fixed on the thirtieth day after the previous month or the thirty-first day. Once Rosh Chodesh was proclaimed by the Sanhedrin, the information was immediately passed to Jewish communities all over Eretz Yisroel and the Diaspora to enable them to keep YomTov on the correct day. The most reliable method of sending this information was with authorized messengers. However, messengers took a long time travelling to these communities and could only reach the Eretz Yisroel communities before YomTov would begin. As a result, those communities that were not reached had to consider both day thirty and day thirty-one as Rosh Chodesh regarding fixing the date of YomTov. Accordingly, they had to keep two days as YomTov. Today, although we all use a standard calendar and no longer need to receive information from Sanhedrin via messenger, we still keep both days of YomTov outside Eretz Yisroel as a Minhag and as a precaution lest we forget the calculations as a result of persecution. We know that the second day of YomTov is really *Chol*, a weekday, Mideoraisa, and yet we are commanded to keep it holy Miderabonon. In fact, there are some Halachos that are even strengthened to make us take YomTov Sheini seriously. [See Rosh Hashana 18a, Beitza 4b, etc. Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim 496.]

Since the original YomTov Sheini was instituted by the Diaspora communities as a *Skeika Deyoma*, a question about which day was YomTov, each day must be treated as though it is "the" YomTov, and the other day is Chol relative to it. Thus, the first day is Erev YomTov relative to the second day, and the second night is Motzoei YomTov relative to the first day. This is *Lechumra*, taking the stringent aspects of the Soseik. There is even an opinion in the Talmud that one recites Havdallah on the second night of YomTov because the first day is over. Actually, once it was established by the Rabbis that we should keep the second day

as YomTov, it is no longer a real Sofek, rather a Mitzvah Miderabonon. If it were a Sofek, one could not say Berachos even for Kiddush using Hashem's name. [See Halochoscope Vol 1 No 5.] Since it is a Mitzvah Miderabonon, one may recite a Brocha in the same way we say a Brocha on the Megilla and on kindling the Menorah and Shabbos candles. [See Beitza 4b. Shabbos 23a. See also Sh. Ar. O.C. 661,473, commentaries, etc.]

(B) Hachanah

It is forbidden to do anything on Shabbos or YomTov as a preparation for the next day which is Chol. This is considered a Mideoraisa by the Halacha authorities. Even preparing on YomTov for Shabbos when YomTov is Erev Shabbos is forbidden, according to many authorities Mideoraisa. This is derived from the verses in the Torah stating that all food should be prepared on Erev Shabbos for Shabbos, meaning that only on a Chol day may one prepare for a holy day and not vice-versa, or even on one holy day for another. (There is a possible exception regarding preparing on the first day of Pesach for the seventh day. [See Shaar Hatziyum 503:4]) This prohibition includes preparation that does not require Melacha. An example of Hachanah that is not a Melacha, yet is forbidden, is taking out wine to prepare for Havdallah before Shabbos is over. Since Havdallah is made as a proclamation of Chol, it is obviously being made on Chol and one may not prepare for Havdallah before it is definitely Chol. One may tidy the house on Shabbos, but one may not fold clothing before putting them away. [See Beitza 2b. Eruvin 38a, etc. Pesachim 46b-47a, commentaries, Poskim summarized in Biur Halacha 527. See Magen Avrohom O.C. 254:23]

Accordingly, since the second night of YomTov is Chol relative to the first day, one may not prepare on the first day for the second night. This means that one may not begin cooking for the second night until it is definitely night; neither may one wash dishes or set the table before dark. Candle-lighting is also forbidden. If it is dark, one may light candles even during the daytime in order to see, even in late afternoon. One may recite the Berachos on these candles because they will also be alight for YomTov Sheini. However, usually we have enough electric lighting to manage without the extra candle-light in the late afternoon, so that even kindling the candles in the late afternoon has the obvious appearance of Hachanah. It is even forbidden to place the candles in the candlesticks before nightfall. [See Sh. Ar. O.C. 514:5 commentaries and Levush. Be'er Haitev O.C. 504:4.]

When preparing food on the first day for use the same day, one may fill the pot with more than is needed so that there will be enough for the second night or day as well. This is because it does not take extra effort to cook a fuller pot. However, once the food is already in the pot, one may not add extra except when cooking meat or fish because although the extra is actually being cooked for YomTov Sheini, the whole pot will cook better the more meat there is, so the extra is being added also to improve the food being eaten that day. [See Betza 17 commentaries Sh. Ar. O.C. 503 and commentaries.]

Another exception to the rule of Hachanah is rinsing cups. Rinsing dishes and cutlery is forbidden on the first day after the meal, unless one knows that there will still be another meal that day. However, since one can drink anytime for the rest of the day, one may rinse cups in case they are needed that day. Here, again, if it is so late in the day that one cannot foresee drinking from these cups before nightfall, they may not be rinsed. [See Shabbos 118 Sh. Ar. O.C. 323:6]

This poses a problem in our case: Taking challahs out of the freezer on the first day for the second night is a case of Hachanah. This is especially true if they are taken out late in the day when they will not defrost before nightfall and it is evident that they were removed in preparation for the next day YomTov. If they are taken out before or during the last meal, which is usually around midday, it could be argued that it is not obvious that they are being prepared for the evening since they could be used for the daytime Seudah if they defrost in time. If one is removing a bag of challahs for the daytime Seudah but there are four in the bag and only two are needed, it would appear that one may remove the whole bag at one time from the freezer. Even though one is preparing for the night, since there is no extra effort involved because he has to take some of the challahs out anyway, it is comparable to putting a pot on to cook with more than is needed. In this case it is permissible, but removing them late in the day, when there are no plans for another meal before night, would therefore be forbidden.

However, an unusual case is discussed and, by reconciling it we may find a way to allow our case: On Shabbos and YomTov one may not travel more than two thousand cubits (about three-quarters of a mile by some accounts) outside of the built-up area of a city in all directions. If one wishes to travel a further distance in one direction, he can place an *Eruv Techumin*, enough food for two meals, at the end of the two thousand cubit limit in the direction he wishes to travel. This way he may travel another two thousand in that direction, but he may not travel at all in the opposite direction. The Eruv must be in place at dusk before Shabbos or YomTov. The same Eruv may be used for both days of YomTov, but, since we consider each day as a separate YomTov, it must be in place at dusk on the first day for the second day. This need not involve Hachanah since one could leave the Eruv there on Erev YomTov for the duration of the whole first day until nightfall. If, however, one is afraid that it might be eaten or otherwise removed, one may remove it after nightfall on the first night and bring it back on the first day towards nightfall and guard it there until after nightfall. This is mystifying since it appears to be a blatant case of Hachanah; in fact, there is an explicit reference to Hachanah in a related case: Another way to make Eruv Techumin is *Me'arev Beraglov*, by walking to the spot and spending twilight (from sunset until nightfall) there. One can also walk close to the spot and point to it and declare "Here I will have *Shvisa*, be 'stationed', for Shabbos!" On the first day of YomTov one may walk to the spot, but may not say the above proclamation because of Hachanah. [See Eruvin 38a-b. Sh. Ar. O.C. 416:2 commentaries.]

One approach to reconcile this case is that merely transporting the food to the spot is never considered Hachanah because only completing something is Hachanah. Walking or moving something from place to place is not considered a complete job. Obviously, this opinion holds that declaring one's Shvisa is a complete accomplishment. A support to this is that when moving one's furniture back from the Succah, one may move a table that has removable legs back into one's house with its legs on Shmini Atzeres. However, if one had to dismantle the legs from the table, one may not put them back together until after dark. The reason is because moving it is not a complete job, whereas reattaching the legs would be. The problem with this approach is that we find that it is forbidden to bring wine for Kiddush for the second night before nightfall because of Hachanah although nothing more than transporting the wine was done. The answer given here is that it is only forbidden to do something minor such as transporting something close to nightfall when one is

clearly preparing for the second night. Earlier in the day it is not so evident that it is for that night since it is possible that it will be eaten during the day so it is allowed. However, one should still transport it with a *Shinui*, differently from the way one transports it on a weekday. [See Sh. Ar. O.C. 667. Magen Avrohom 3. Chaye Adam Klal 153:6.]

Accordingly, it would be permissible in our case to take the frozen challahs out of the freezer, with a *Shinui*, early enough on the first day that they could thaw and be eaten on that day.

©1993 Rabbi Shimon Silver

ANNOUNCEMENTS

SCHEDULE:

MINCHA Both days of YomTov	9:05 PM
Earliest time for candle-lighting/Melacha 2nd night	9:28 PM
SHACHARIS FRIDAY	7:00 AM
<u>PARSHAS NASO:</u>	
Plag Hamincha - Earliest time for candle-lighting	7:08 PM
CANDLE-LIGHTING NASO	8:23 PM
MINCHA EREV SHABBOS	7:00 PM
SHABBOS MINCHA	8:20 PM
MINCHA SUNDAY-THURSDAY	8:30 PM
Plag Hamincha - BEHA'ALOSCHA	7:13 PM
CANDLE-LIGHTING BEHA'ALOSCHA	8:28 PM

Kiddush the first day of YomTov will be given by Rabbi Marine and the second day by Shai Miller in honor of Yortzites they have on those days.

SHIURIM:

- There will be shiurim on the first night of Shavuot all night in conjunction with the Kollel. See the posted signs.
- MEGILAS RUS - One hour before Mincha on both days of YomTov.
- There will be a shiur between Mincha and Maariv on the first day of YomTov by Rabbi Langsam. Topic: Dovid and Goliath, the true story.
- GEMORO MAKOS SUNDAY 7:15 AM
- HALACHA B'IYUN MONDAY 9:00 PM
- HILCHOS SHABBOS SHABBOS 8:15 AM

This issue of HALOCHOSCOPE has been sponsored by Rabbi Avrohom Langsam in memory of his father, R' Elimelech ben Pelsach Hakohen zichrono livracha, and by Shai Miller in memory of his mother Chana Bas Moshe zichronah livracha whose Yortzites are on the first and second days of Shavuot, respectively.

Any and all comments and suggestions are welcome and can be addressed to :
 Rabbi Shimon Silver
 Congregation Shaaray Teffillah
 5741 Bartlett Street
 Pittsburgh, PA 15217