

HALOCHOSCOPE

This week's (and next week's) question:

Someone has an electric coffee maker plugged in for the duration of *Yomtov* on a timer. May water be added before the timer turns it on? Assuming this is permitted on *Yomtov*, may this be done on *Erev Shabbos* as well, so the coffee will brew on *Shabbos*? If it is not permitted to do this to make coffee, may it be done to protect the appliance from heating up with no water in it? May one remove the 'on' pin from the timer while it has the appliance switched off to prevent it from turning the appliance on? Does preparation of an *Eruv Tavshilin* help in this situation in any way?

The issues:

Last Issue:

A) *Melechtes Ochel Nefesh*, *melacha* involved in the preparation of food on *Yomtov*

B) *Chamin Shehuchmu Beshabbos*, using water heated on *Shabbos* by a timer

In this issue:

C) Cooking with electricity on *Yomtov*

D) *Muktzeh* and moving it indirectly; *Tikun Kli*, what counts as repairing

E) *Eruv Tavshilin*

C) *Cooking with electricity on Yomtov*

Based on the discussion so far, the majority of poskim would permit setting up the coffee maker on a regular *Erev Shabbos* on a timer. Our question involves a machine that is already being controlled by a timer. To understand how this does or does not apply to our situation, we should summarize the issues of electricity on *Shabbos* or *Yomtov*.

Turning on an electric circuit might not always involve a Scriptural manifestation of *hav'arah*, igniting, but is considered forbidden, at least Rabbinically. When a glow is produced, whether it is a metal filament or element, otherwise known as *gacheless shel mat-e chess*, or a gas filled light, Scriptural *hav'arah* is involved. When no glow is produced, no Scriptural *hav'arah* is violated. Some poskim maintain that other *melachos* are violated, including *boneh*, building, adding to or enhancing a structure attached to the ground. If a circuit is wired through a house, completing it enhances the house. Others maintain that it is akin to opening or closing a door or window. Some suggest that causing copper wire to fulfill its higher purpose or use in the Creation of the world is a type of *boneh*, constructive building, but this is considered a minority view. What is actually given more consideration is the idea that completing a circuit has an element of *tikun kli*, fixing or repairing a utensil. Nonetheless, others contend that the 'utensil' is already complete, and that the switch is really normal 'use'. Using the power is considered some form of Rabbinical *hav'arah*. Extinguishing it is considered *kibuy*. However, *kibuy*, even on a glowing ember, is only forbidden Scripturally, according to the prevailing practice, if it is done to produce charcoal. If it is done to put out the flame, it is still forbidden, but Rab-

binically. This is called *melacha she'ainah tzricha legufah*. A *gacheless shel matechess* can never be turned into charcoal. Thus, by definition, *kibuy* of a circuit can not be Scripturally forbidden. Since charcoal is not even produced by the way, this *kibuy* is considered more lenient. Under certain circumstances it is relaxed totally. Those who consider starting a circuit *boneh*, building, also consider stopping it *sosair*, demolishing.

Accordingly, turning on a circuit will a light bulb or coil involves Scriptural *hav'arah*. Turning on an appliance that does not have a glowing coil, even if it heats up, is forbidden Rabbinically. It should be noted that a coil is considered glowing even if it flows very faintly in a fully darkened room.

On *Yomtov* one may do *hav'arah* and *kibuy* for food preparation. Thus, one may use an existing flame, add fuel, kindle other flames from it, and when necessary reduce or extinguish it. One may not be *molid aish*, create a new flame. There are two ways to interpret this. One view maintains that one may not use something that did not exist before *Yomtov*. It is *nolad*, a type of *muktzeh*, similar to a newly laid egg. The other view maintains that igniting a fire could be done before *Yomtov*, then kept alight. *Melachos* for food preparation that can be done before *Yomtov* may not be done on *Yomtov*. However, *nolad* is not an issue according to this view. A newly-laid egg is consumed. A fire continues burning after its use. Thus, if a fire was indeed started on *Yomtov* it is not *muktzeh*.

In the early days of electricity, some poskim, under the impression that electricity was stored in the wires, considered it an existing flame. All that is needed is to flick the switch and transfer the electricity through the wires. Most poskim dismiss this lenient view. Switching on the circuit does not produce electricity but directs the current, but it introduces new electricity to the circuit. This is *molid aish*. In addition, if the circuit has a *gacheless shel matechess* on it the new flame is produced. [When tapping into an A/C power supply, there is the possibility that at the moment that one switches on his interior circuit the outside wires do not have any current, as they are in the minute interval between the two directions. If this is the case, the user has done nothing direct himself, but a *grama*. The current that will run through his internal wires will now go on by itself. Thus, the *melacha* is *safek psik raisha*, a result that is not inevitable, even if he hit the switch when the current was on.]

Accordingly, contemporary poskim forbid turning on a circuit on *Yomtov*. However, one may adjust a circuit to regulate the amount of electricity. If the coil does not have a glow, one may not turn it up to the point that it glows. [If one wishes to adjust a stove with coils, he should take care to mark the point of the palest glow in a darkened room. Then he may use it either above the mark or below it, but may not go from below it to above it.] In our case, the ignition of the appliance is automatic. There is no issue of *molid aish*, and the consensus of poskim is not concerned with *nolad per se*. Therefore, if the timer is set to go on during *Yomtov*, there should be no problem using the coffee maker. We have already shown that many poskim would permit it to be used for *Shabbos* this way as well. [See e.g. Chazon Ish OC 38:2 50:9. Minchas Shlomo I:9. Etc. For a summary of the contemporary view on electricity, See Tzitz Eliezer I:20.]

D) Muktzeh; Tikun Kli

Part of our question deals with removing the pin from the timer, so that it does not turn the appliance on. While the appliance is off, the timer is a small appliance in its own

right, and it is on. One is adjusting the mechanical tripping of the switch by removing the pin. This touches on two further issues: *muktzeh*, moving an item that may not be moved on *Shabbos* or *Yomtov*; and *tikun kli*, fixing a utensil to make it usable or more usable.

Muktzeh is a Rabbinic restriction on moving items that are *muktzeh mida'as*, placed out of mind for the duration of *Shabbos*. The ordinance was instituted in stages, starting in the days of King David. For the most part, the present decrees protect the sanctity of *Shabbos*. The main categories are: *kli shamalachto le'issur*, a utensil usually used to do something forbidden, but that has permissible uses. This may be moved for its permissible use or for its space; *muktzeh machmas gufo*, material that is not a utensil and has no anticipated use on *Shabbos*; *muktzeh machmas chisaron kis*, items that are precious. This last category is described as items that are left in a designated place. Some say this is due to their fragility. Others say it is because one does not use them for anything but their normal use; *basis ledavar he'asur*, something holding a *muktzeh* item on it; *graf shel re'i*, a waste container that is otherwise usable and has become repulsive or objectionable; *muktzeh machmas issur* will inevitably involve a violation while being moved.

Electric appliances that are used on *Shabbos* can be *muktzeh*. Parts of the appliances, doors, removable carafes and spigots etc. may be moved. Especially on *Yomtov*, when cooking itself is permitted, the appliances themselves are used for cooking. The timer in our question is *muktzeh*. It is used only to turn on or off appliances or lights, a forbidden activity. There are no permissible uses for the timer. Even using it as a doorstop or paperweight is unlikely. It could fall into the category of *chisaron kis* according to one or both views. The pins on the timer are *muktzeh*. Some also point out that the timer is a *basis ledavar he'asur* while the appliance is on. Therefore, at the onset of *Shabbos* the owner could not have had in mind to move it even when it was off.

One way that true *muktzeh* may be moved is *tiltul begufo*, moving with parts of the body not usually used for this. [Sometimes, this is called *kile'achar yad*, though this term usually applies to *melachos* being performed in an unusual fashion, something that it is highly questionable whether it can apply to *muktzeh*. See Rema OC 308:3 RAE] Thus, one might be able to move the pins on the timer this way, even while it is operating. However, a better solution would be to ask a gentile to do remove it.

Tikun kli is a part of the *melachos* of *boneh*, *sosair* and *makeh bepatish*, building, demolishing and finishing a utensil. In some instances this is Scriptural, such as when an entire utensil is formed. When the appliance is attached, some poskim maintain that any adjustment touches on Scriptural *boneh* or *tikun kli*. Adjustments done routinely as part of the common use do not raise this issue. Thus, opening a door, screwing a bottle cap, and adjusting knobs on a stove, do not constitute *tikun kli*. The Talmud permits assembling portable beds, lamps made up of parts and removable shutters of cupboards (with no screws). One may not return a screw, even loosely, lest he tighten it. One may not thread laces into a shoe for the first time, nor stuff a pillow, but may return these if they fell out. A shovel handle is wedged into the shovel, then held in place with a dowel. This is forbidden. One view considers it *boneh*, finishing an entire *kli*. Another considers it *makeh bepatish*. Timer pins are adjustable, but are made to be wedged tightly at the chosen time. This appears to be a serious issue in this case. [See references to Halachoscope IX:21. Chazon Ish OC 38:2. Minchas Yitzchok I:58 II:110 III:37. Tzitz Eliezer I:20:9.]

E) Eruv Tavshilin

From the discussion so far, adjusting the pin is problematic. Adding water be cooked on *Shabbos* by the timer is permitted by most poskim. Our case, though, involves *hachanah*, preparing on *Yomtov* for the next day. The Talmud debates *hachanah*, based as it is on the Torah terminology with regard to the *mohn*. One view maintains that this forbids *hachanah* Scripturally even from *Yomtov* to *Shabbos*. The other view maintains that only preparing for *chol* is forbidden Scripturally. Preparing for *Shabbos* is like preparing for the same day of *Yomtov*; *Shabbos* continues the holiness of *Yomtov*. It is still forbidden Rabbinically. *Eruv tavshilin* was instituted Rabbinically to suspend their own prohibition. It was also intended to ensure that a decent portion would be set aside for *Shabbos* as well as *Yomtov*. By preparing some food for *Shabbos* from *Erev Yomtov*, one 'continue' his preparations on *Yomtov*. According to the other view, cooking early enough in the day might not be considered preparing for the next day. If guests would come before the evening, they could eat it that day. It is still forbidden because of the possibility. This is the part of the prohibition suspended by the Rabbis. The difference between the two views applies to food cooked too late to be used that day.

In our case, if the placing of the water is indeed considered *hachanah*, whether or not we consider it *grama* of cooking (since even real cooking is permitted), it is not going to be ready in time for guests by evening. This view will not be satisfied. In emergencies, one may rely on the lenient view. However, in our case, there is no emergency. The coffee maker should not go on if it has no water left. Usually, these machines only heat the water in the machine that is measured according to how much coffee one makes. The ideal would be to leave the machine alone. [See Beitza 2b 15b-17b, Psachim 46b, Poskim. Tur Sh Ar OC 253-4 257 318, 503:1 527:1 667:1, commentaries.]

On the Parsha ... One may do 'knivas yarak' on Yom Kippur after mincha ketana, for the night meal. [It was later forbidden. People took liberties.] ... [Shabbos 113b-4a] The consensus is that *knivas yarak* is a preparation of greens that does not involve *melacha*, but *tircha*, bother. It is forbidden to prepare on *Shabbos* or *Yomtov* for the next day (or evening) even through *tircha*. The Rabbis permitted it in this case, either because it adds preparer's pain of the fast, or because it is needed to avert the danger of having nothing prepared to break the fast. The question is, while no *melacha* is performed, *hachanah* is violated. The answer seems to be that the *hachanah* of *tircha* is not forbidden Scripturally but Rabbinically [See *Pri Megadim* OC 610]. The Rabbis allowed it in this case. [If so, our case might qualify as a Rabbinical restriction, and maybe the *eruv* would help, even if it will not be ready for the same day!]

🕯 Sponsored by Aharon Pfeffer, in memory of his grandmother, Rivkah bas Yisroel

Unger a"h, whose *yahrzeit* was on the 2nd of Tishrei. 🕯

© Rabbi Shimon Silver, September 2007.

Subscriptions and Sponsorships available. (412) 421-0508. halochoscope@hotmail.com